

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

REPORT TO: Planning Committee

2 April 2014

AUTHOR/S: Planning and New Communities Director

Application Number: S/1776/13/FL

Parish(es): Over

Proposal: Listed Building consent for extension and conversion of barn to dwelling

Site address: Ivy House, 12 Fen End, Over

Applicant(s): Mr and Mrs A Stockbridge

Recommendation: Approve

Key material considerations: Listed Building

Committee Site Visit: No

Departure Application: No

Presenting Officer: Andrew Fillmore

Application brought to Committee because: The officer recommendation is contrary to the views of the Parish Council

Date by which decision due: 9 October 2013

Planning History

1. S/0336/FL Erection of implement shed following demolition of barn. Approved.

Planning Policies

2. *National*
 3. National Planning Policy Framework
 4. *Adopted Local Development Framework, Development Control Policies*
- CH/3 Listed Buildings
- .5. *Supplementary Planning Document(s)*

Listed Building: Works to or affecting the setting of – adopted 2009

Consultations

6. **Over Parish Council** - Recommend refusal.

Councillors recommend refusal on the grounds that this application would have a detrimental impact on the setting of the adjacent listed building i.e. 12 Fen End and the Dovecote in the grounds thereof. It would also change forever the views and setting of these significant and unique landmark listed buildings and the cumulative effect of incremental development would be unacceptable in this setting. The access onto Fen End at this juncture would constitute a danger to road users as there is a sharp blind bend to one side of the property with very limited visibility. Should this application be granted this unique property would be irreparably compromised.

7. **Conservation Officer** – No objection. The requested additional supporting information and plans are satisfactory.

Representations

8. None received

Planning Comments

9. The application site comprises a barn to the rear of Ivy House. Ivy House is a Grade 2 listed dwelling located on Fen End, Over and has the following listing description;

'Grade II House, late C17. Some minor C19 alterations. Red Brick with steeply pitched tiled roof, tumbled end parapets on kneelers, and a Dutch gable end to the wing to the road. Projecting end stacks with offsets. Plan of three room main range with wing to road, forming a T-plan. Two storeys and attics with plain band at eaves height and between storeys. The wing to the road has a segmental parapet on plain pilasters also of brick, surmounted by ball finials of stone. The pilasters frame the elevation which is divided by the bands. Original flat arches to five flush frame horizontal sliding sashes. There have been minor repairs in brick to the front, rear and end walls. At left hand one recessed hung sash above the doorway, and at right hand a lean to roof has been made to a small C19 addition. The rear elevation has plain pilasters to the corners and flanking to the rear doorway. Doors of raised and fielded panels. The location of the original door to the street is not clear. Interior: The house preserves the original plan of two rooms on either side of narrow hall and stairbay. The wing to the road is of two window bays. The staircase is c.1660 with flat section balusters and original rail. Stop chamfered beams to ground floor rooms. There are doors with raised and fielded panels. This house, No 14 Fen End and No 22 High Street, are possibly associated with Dutch prisoners of war which, it is believed, were used in construction of the New Bedford River and remained after peace was concluded in 1654'

10. As the barn was erected prior to 1948 and is located within the curtilage of Ivy House it is listed by association.

11. In addition to the barn which is the subject of the application a number of further outbuildings can be found to the rear of Ivy House including a barn located directly to the front of the application site which has consent (S/0336/FL) to be replaced by an implement shed, and the 'Dovecote' which is separately listed Grade 2 and has the following list description;

'late C17 and C19 alterations: Red brick with rebuilt upper course of gable ends and tiled roof. Dentil eaves cornice. Square. Interior: The nesting boxes have been removed and a floor inserted'

12. The application proposal seeks listed building consent for conversion of the barn to a residential dwelling including construction of a rear extension and replacing the sheet metal roof with thatch. The rear extension measures 9.5m (length) x 4.2m (width) and has a height to the ridge of 6m.

Listed Building

13. The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 states that in considering whether to grant listed building consent for any works the local planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
14. Section 12 of the NPPF addresses heritage assets. Paragraph 131 requires planning authorities to take account of the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets.
15. Paragraph 132 advises when considering the impact of a proposed development on the significance of a designated heritage asset, great weight should be given to the assets conservation, with the more important the asset the greater the weight should be. This advice goes on to state that heritage assets are irreplaceable, with any harm or loss requiring clear and convincing justification.
16. Paragraph 133 recognises that there are different levels of harm which are identified as "substantial" and "less than substantial", and paragraph 134 advises that where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of the designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing it optimum viable use.

Substantial or less than substantial harm

17. English Heritages publication 'Conserving Principles, Policies and Guidance' sets out a method for thinking systematically and consistently about the heritage values that can be ascribed to a place and sets out four categories in this assessment;

Evidential value: the potential of a place to yield evidence about past human activity.

Historical value: the ways in which past people, events and aspects of life can be connected through a place to the present.

esthetic value: the ways in which people draw sensory and intellectual stimulation from a place.

Communal value: the meanings of a place for the people who relate to it, or for whom it figures in their collective experience or memory.

18. Evidential value derives from the physical remains that have been inherited from the past, and the ability to understand and interpret the evidence tends to be diminished in proportion to the extent of its removal or replacement. The barns historical agricultural use is still evident; however this is not so important as to list this structure in its own right.
19. Historical value derives from the ways in which past people; events and aspects of life can be connected through a place to the present and tends to be illustrative or

associative. The barn is an historic building but is not so rare as to provide unique evidence about the past.

20. Aesthetic value derives from the ways in which people draw sensory and intellectual stimulation from a place. The barn's historical appearance has been notably compromised through the introduction of a sheet metal roof and as such scores low in this category.
21. Communal value derives from the meaning(s) of a place for the people who relate to it, or for whom it figures in their collective experience or memory, and is often closely bound up with historical and aesthetic values. War memorials often score highly in this category. The barn which has always remained in private use is located in a private rear garden and is of little communal value.
22. In summary the barn scores 'moderately' on both Evidential and Historical value but 'low' on Aesthetic and Communal value, and the assessment turns to the impact of the development.
23. The construction of the rear single storey extension measuring 9.5m in length, and more importantly the introduction of domestic paraphernalia such as boundary treatment and washing lines which are associated with residential properties will add a degree of domestication thereby detracting from the buildings historical agricultural use and listed status. As such the proposal results in harm to the listed building.
24. However, as part of the conversion the buildings timber frame is to be preserved with a central open space (the essential quality of the barn) retained. Furthermore the barns frontage to Fen End (and Ivy House) remains largely unaltered, with the introduction of a thatch roof a welcome reflection of the buildings past. As such the identified harm is tempered and considered 'less than substantial', which is reflective of the buildings status as listed by association rather than in its own right.

Substantial Harm vs Public Benefit

25. Paragraph 134 of the NPPF advises that where the harm identified is 'less than substantial' this needs to be weighed against the public benefit, including securing its 'optimum viable use'.
26. The barn is currently used for the storage of hay for the applicant's horses and serves no real economic use. The conversion of the barn to an independent dwelling house would introduce a more optimum economic use whereby the owners would more likely maintain the building to a high standard and therefore ensure the long term viability of the listed building and its key features.
27. The historical use of the building in agriculture is not viable, and officers are of the view that securing the long term future of the barn as a well maintained structure would result in a public benefit which outweighs the identified harm.
28. The Parish Council oppose the application on grounds the development would result in a detrimental impact on the setting of two listed buildings (Ivy House and Dovecote), through changing the views of and setting of these significant and unique landmarks. Whilst the development would result in an adverse impact this harm is not so significant and outweighed by the public benefits of the scheme.

Conclusions

29. It is considered the conversion of this barn which is listed by association with Ivy House would result in some harm to the building; however this harm is outweighed by the public benefit of securing the barn's long term retention through a viable use.
30. The proposal therefore complies with the provisions of the development plan and national planning policies contained within the NPPF and as such it is recommended that permission be granted subject to the conditions outlined below.

Recommendation

31. Approval subject to the following conditions –
1. The works to which this consent relates shall be started not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this decision notice.
(Reason - To ensure that consideration of any future application for works will not be prejudiced by listed building consents which have not been acted upon.)
 2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: 'Site Location Plan', 'Existing and Proposed Sections and Elevations' Drawing number '212/187/03 rev P2', 'Barn Elevations –East and North', 'Barn Elevations – Revisions' and 'Floor Plans – Revision'
(Reason - To facilitate any future application to the Local Planning Authority under Section 73 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.)

Background Papers

Where [the Local Authorities \(Executive Arrangements\) \(Meetings and Access to Information\) \(England\) Regulations 2012](#) require documents to be open to inspection by members of the public, they must be available for inspection: -

- (a) at all reasonable hours at the offices of South Cambridgeshire District Council;
- (b) on the Council's website; and
- (c) in the case of documents to be available for inspection pursuant to regulation 15, on payment of a reasonable fee required by the Council by the person seeking to inspect the documents at the offices of South Cambridgeshire District Council.

The following list contains links to the documents on the Council's website or elsewhere at which copies can be inspected.

- Nation Planning Policy Framework
<https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/national-planning-policy-framework--2>
- Local Development Framework, Development Control Policies, Adopted July 2007
<http://www.scambs.gov.uk/content/local-development-framework>
- South Cambridgeshire Local Plan, Proposed Submission July 2013
<http://www.scambs.gov.uk/localplan>

Report Author: Andrew Fillmore – Senior Planning Officer
Telephone: (01954) 713180